"Elladale"
358 Maitland Road, Mayfield NSW 2304
Heritage Impact Statement
Issue B | 04 November 2013

Nominated Architect: Linda Babic, NSW ARB 6869, AIA
173 Russell Road, New Lambton NSW 2305 ABN: 13 969 355 650
T | 02 4957 8003  F | 02 4957 8004  E | mail@heritas.com.au  W | heritas.com.au
1 Introduction

1.1 Background

This report represents an assessment of heritage impact for the proposed deconstruction of the dwelling known as "Elladale", a substantial stone cottage located at 358 Maitland Road, Mayfield NSW. It was prepared by Linda Babic, B.A., B.Arch., M.Herit.Cons. for the Department of Community & Family Services, Northern Region - Housing NSW.

The land and waters of Newcastle are acknowledged as the country of Awabakal, Wonnarua and Worimi peoples, whose culture is increasingly celebrated in community events, place naming, signage and artworks. "Elladale" is located in the Newcastle suburb of Mayfield, however the area was originally known as Waratah.

"Elladale" is an item of local cultural heritage significance, defined under the Newcastle Local Environmental Plan 2012. This report considers the impact of the proposed works on the significance of "Elladale".
1.2 Methodology

This report has been undertaken in accordance with the requirements of the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter (2000), and the guidelines given in the documents Assessing Heritage Significance (2001) and Statements of Heritage Impact (2002) as issued by the NSW Heritage Council.

All photographs are by the project team unless otherwise noted.

The site location was originally part of the suburb of Waratah, the northern part of which was later re-named Mayfield.

1.3 Limitations and Constraints

None noted.

1.4 Document Status

The current status and history of this document is described in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Notes/Revisions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issue A</td>
<td>04 November 2013</td>
<td>issued for client review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issue B</td>
<td>15 November 2013</td>
<td>issued for DA submission</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2 History

2.1 Development of Waratah

The first land grant in the Waratah area was made in 1831 to George Dent but it was not developed until the mid 1840s when the owner at that time, Thomas Grove, established an orchard and timbergetting business on the 60 acre property. However, there was no settlement in the area until around 1857 when about six families, engaged in timbergetting for the construction of the Great Northern Railway, built huts in the vicinity of present day Smart and Bridge Streets. By the end of the 1850s the first train station out of Newcastle had been built at Waratah, providing the impetus for settlement and development of the surrounding district. Now linked to Maitland by the Newcastle-Maitland Road and also the new railway, Waratah was becoming an attractive area for those wishing to live in a semi-rural environment away from the bustle and sooty atmosphere of the increasingly busy coal loading port at Newcastle.

2.2 William Petherbridge: 1864

In response to the demand for land in this area, the government offered 41 suburban lots in the Village of Waratah for auction in March 1864. Four of the larger allotments, Lots 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5, Section 8 with frontages to both Maitland Road and Waratah Street, were purchased by William Petherbridge. Lots 4 and 5 were subsequently sold, leaving Petherbridge with an allotment encompassing 3 acres bounded by Maitland Road, Fitzroy Street and Waratah Street.

Figure 2
Plan showing allotments in Section 8.
source: NSW LPI

© History prepared by Hunter History Consultants Pty Ltd for Heritage Impact Statement by Heritas Architecture. Not to be used for any other purpose without written permission of the author

W.J. Goold, “The Early Days”, in Jubilee Celebrations Committee, 50 Years of Progress, 1900-1950, Mayfield Jubilee Celebrations, Souvenir Booklet, Newcastle, 1950, p. 3; Braye, “Waratah…”, p. 120.


Certificate of Title, Vol.514, Folio 141, 18 October 1867, NSW LTO.
Described on the deeds as a “merchant”, Petherbridge had arrived in the Colony in 1853 with his wife and young family. No doubt attracted by the gold rushes, he spent several years at Molong and Bathurst as a general storekeeper and also as an employee of a large commercial business. In 1863 he became manager of the spirit department of Messrs. Tooth and Co. in Newcastle, and also manager for their wines, ales and spirits in Maitland. The family settled in Newcastle in a large house overlooking the sea, but the move to Newcastle brought sadness with the death of two young children, one in 1863 and another in 1865. Petherbridge’s wife, Lydia, died in 1868 leaving seven children aged between 7 and 23.

William Petherbridge may have been seeking a fresh start for his children when he embarked on the construction of a new family home. Tenders were called in March 1869 to build a stone rubble cottage on his land at Waratah. A visitor to the area in November 1871 commented on the large amounts of stone that were being carted from Waratah to Newcastle for building purposes. He also penned a favourable description of the new Petherbridge home and gardens:

Mr. William Petherbridge, so well known in your city, and who has a very fine garden of four acres on the Maitland Road, has recently finished an elegant and substantial stone-built residence, and has apparently spared no expense in procuring the most choice description of flowers, vines and fruit trees and, certainly, has succeeded in creating for himself a splendid retreat from the cares of business in a crowded city. He has shown most prominently what can be done with the expenditure of a little money, a little patience, and a little perseverance. [NB: At the time of writing Petherbridge was occupying 4 acres but his holding was subsequently reduced to 3 acres].

The rubble stone house, which was built across Lots 2 and 3, was described some years later as:

Containing drawing-room, sitting-room, dining room, five bedrooms, pantry, dairy, scullery, wash-house, servants’ and grooms’ rooms, splendid underground tanks with never-failing supply of water, stables, buggy-house, and every convenience for a gentleman’s country residence.

Great care was taken with the gardens which were planted with fruit trees, ornamental plants and flowering shrubs.

During the early 1870s Petherbridge left Tooth & Co. to establish his own business, with branches in Newcastle and Maitland. However, health problems arising from long term asthma and bronchitis forced him to sell the Newcastle branch and soon after he sold the business to his sons, Frederick and Thomas. By 1875 Petherbridge had moved to Maitland but he retained ownership of the Waratah house which most likely became a rental property. Unfortunately records which would indicate the occupants of the house at this time have not survived.

---

5 Maitland Mercury (MM), 25 March 1890.
6 NSW Births Deaths and Marriages indexes, MM 1 August 1867.
7 Newcastle Chronicle (NC), 20 March 1869.
8 NC, 18 November 1871.
9 MM, 25 March 1890.
10 MM 21 October 1869, 21 July 1877.
11 MM 26 November 1876, 4 January 1890.
12 Greville’s Post Office Directory, 1875.
Following Petherbridge’s death in 1889 his house at Waratah was offered for sale by auction, along with a terrace of six houses in Carrington and five allotments in Penrith. However, the old family home did not sell at that stage and continued to be used as a rental.

In February 1903 the executors of Petherbridge’s estate once again advertised the house, standing on 3 acres of land, for auction together with two vacant allotments of land, one in the nearby village of Hanbury (now Waratah) and the other in Mayfield. The house, which was described at the time as “containing 9 rooms, kitchen, bathroom, pantry, stabling and outhouses, verandah on three sides” failed to sell and continued to be rented. Despite the increasing demand for household allotments which led to the subdivision of adjoining Lots 4, 5 and 6, the residents of “Elladale” continued to enjoy the extensive gardens that had been planted by William Petherbridge.

---

13 MM 25 March 1890.
14 NMH 28 February 1903, HDWB Rate Books.
DP 4306, prepared in 1904 and showing the subdivision of Lots 4, 5 and 6, Section 8. Lots 11 and 12 would later become part of the site now occupied by the "Elladale" housing estate. "Elladale" occupies Lots 1-3.

source: NSW LPI

Undated photograph taken during a family gathering (most likely the Petherbridge family) at "Elladale".

source: Snowball Collection, Newcastle Region Library
2.3 James Puidilles Edwards: 1908

The next owner of the house was James Puidilles Edwards. It seems likely that it was he who named it “Elladale”, which is based on the initials of his daughters, Emily, Lizzie, Lucy, Ada and Annie. Although he did not legally purchase the property until April 1908, Edwards and his daughters Annie and Lucy, both in their early twenties, had been living in the house from at least 1898.\textsuperscript{15}

In his late seventies, Edwards had been widowed in 1890. His career was centred around the development of the NSW railway system, initially working as a construction contractor and from the mid-1870s as a stationmaster employed in the Railway Department. Edwards and his wife had 8 children and had spent most of their married life in Double Bay. He was involved in property development in the Woollahra municipality, where he was elected councillor in 1860.

\textsuperscript{15} Transfer, 7 April 1908 in Vol.28 Fol.42, 11 June 1886, NSW LTO; Federal Directory for Newcastle, 1901; NSW Electoral Roll, 1903, Hunter District Water Board Rate Books, 1898-1901.
After serving on a number of committees and working towards the implementation of several significant improvements to Double Bay, he resigned from council in April 1866.\textsuperscript{16}

In December 1905 the upcoming marriage of Lucy Florence Victoria Edwards, “youngest daughter of Mr. James P. Edwards of “Elladale”, Waratah, to Edgar Thomas Griffiths” was announced in the \textit{Maitland Mercury}. Three years later, in April 1908, ownership of the house was officially transferred to Edwards who died three months later at “Elladale”. The property was left to his daughters who subdivided the land for sale as household allotments.\textsuperscript{17}

\subsection*{2.4 The Dodds Family: 1909}

The next owner of “Elladale” was Harry Atkinson Dodds, Engineer of Mayfield. He purchased the allotment on which the house stood, together with an additional 4 adjoining allotments to create a parcel of land encompassing 1 acre, 1 rood, 9 perches.\textsuperscript{18} These allotments are marked as Lots 1, 2, 3, 15 and 16 on a subdivision plan prepared by Surveyor R. W. Langstaff. Harry Atkinson Dodds’ son, George, bought three allotments (Lots 4, 13 and 14) within the subdivision in March 1910 and September 1912.\textsuperscript{19}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure7.png}
\caption{Subdivision of Lots 1, 2 and 3, Section 8. Harry Dodds purchased Lots 1, 2, 3, 15 and 16. George Dodds purchased Lots 4, 13 and 14. source: R. Melville Collection}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{16} \url{www.woollahra.nsw.gov.au/library/local_history}
\textsuperscript{17} \textit{Sydney Morning Herald (SMH)} 30 December 1905, 27 July 1908; Certificate of Title, Vol.28, Fol.42, 11 June 1866 (with updates) Vol.34, Fol.147, 4 October 1877 (with updates).
\textsuperscript{18} Certificate of Title, Vol.2037 Fol.65, 19 February 1910. R. W. Langstaff, Surveyor, Subdivision of Lots 1,2 & 3 Sec.8 Waratah, c.1909. R. Melville collection.
\textsuperscript{19} Certificate of Title, Vol.2295, Fol.77, 21 September 1912, NSW LTO.
George later recalled that when the family moved into “Elladale” there were only two other houses in that part of Waratah – one in Hanbury Street and the other in Waratah Street. However, the opening of the BHP steelworks in 1915 stimulated residential development in the area and by 1918 William Petherbridge’s carefully planted garden had begun to disappear under the increasing urban sprawl.

Following the death of Harry Atkinson Dodds in 1914, ownership of the property passed to Harry Jnr. and his brother, George who was a coachbuilder. George married and settled nearby in Waratah Street but records indicate that Harry did not marry and continued to live at “Elladale” with his mother, Phoebe, and sisters Jane and Sarah, who also remained unmarried.

**H. Dodds & Co.**

In 1912 Harry Dodds jnr. established a patternmaking business, known as H. Dodds and Co., on part of the site, operating out of a large shed on the Waratah St. frontage. The business supplied patterns to a number of significant Newcastle companies including Australian Industrial Refractories, Rylands, Leonora Glass, Sanitarium Health Foods and Burlington Mills (later known as National Textiles).

Alterations to the interior joinery of “Elladale” were also probably fabricated in Harry Dodds’ workshops.

---

20 Newcastle Sun, 21 October 1955.
21 NSW Electoral Rolls, 1930.
2.5 **Service Station / Motor Dealership: 1952-1989**

After their mother’s death in 1943 Harry, Jane and Sarah Dodds continued to live at “Elladale” until 1952 when they subdivided the property into three allotments. The family home was sold and the siblings moved to a house in Gamack St. Mayfield. Harry Dodds retained ownership of the allotment on which his workshop was built and the third allotment, with a weatherboard cottage, became the property of Jane and Sarah Dodds and their married sister, Nancy Ward.\(^{23}\)

In March 1952 “Elladale” was sold to Martin Properties Pty Ltd., which also purchased part of George Dodd’s adjoining property to the west with a frontage to Maitland Road. Part of the site was then leased to Ampol Petroleum which constructed a service station on the Maitland Road frontage.\(^{24}\)

A plan of the property prepared in 1957 shows the service station and also a large area which was occupied by Young and Green Pty Ltd., a local motor dealership which used the old house, including the now demolished eastern rear wing, as office accommodation. Harry Dodds’ patternmaking workshop and a small cottage are also shown on the plan.\(^{25}\)

---

\(^{23}\) NSW Births, Deaths and Marriages Indexes, NSW Electoral Rolls, Certificate of Title, Vol.2037 Fol.65, 19 February 1910 (with updates), Subdivision Plan FP386717, 20 October 1952: NSW LTO.

\(^{24}\) Ibid., Certificate of Title Vol.2041, Fol.51, 5 March 1910: NSW LTO.

\(^{25}\) Hunter District Water Board Plan, Drawn 20 August 1957.
Figure 10, right
Plan of Drainage, 212 Maitland Rd, Mayfield (NB Street numbers have since changed).
source: HDWB, 20 August 1957, courtesy W. Swan

Figure 11, below
Undated photograph showing the Ampol Service Station.
source: courtesy Gionni diGravio
Harry Dodds continued to manage his patternmaking business until 1964 when he sold it to his business partners Bruce Dick, Sid Jefferson and Frank Brighton. George Dodds had died in 1962 and in 1965 the partners had bought the remainder of his adjoining property to the west of the patternmaking workshop, with a frontage to Waratah Street. However, they did not purchase Harry Dodds’ workshop site until December 1971.

Ampol Petroleum purchased the “Elladale” site in October 1961, together with two adjoining properties on the eastern boundary. Ampol retained ownership until March 1967 when the property was sold to Young and Green Pty. Ltd. and one of its subsidiary companies, Motor Accident Mutual Insurance Pty Ltd. For some years the company’s truck sales were carried out from the property, with “Elladale” continuing to be used as an office. When Young and Green announced plans to establish a large car sales complex on the site in 1971, necessitating the demolition of the old house, a journalist from the *Newcastle Sun* expressed concern at the impending destruction of “this fine relic”. His suggestion of relocating the house to Blackbutt Reserve where it could be restored and furnished in Victorian style and used as “a fine old style restaurant or replacement for our local history museum”. However, the owners decided against demolition and “Elladale” continued to serve as one of Newcastle’s most unusual office buildings.

### 2.6 NSW Dept of Housing: 1989

In 1989 the “Elladale” site was sold to the NSW Land and Housing Corporation, together with several surrounding properties. In 1989 a plan of development for site was prepared by a group of developers, architects and builders. This plan was accepted by the NSW Land and Housing Corporation with purchased the “Elladale” site. By September 1989 work was under way on the construction of 40 residential units, including some for the aged and disabled. Construction work for the project was carried out by Belkin Constructions, who had worked together with Architects Snell to produce a design which “aimed to reflect the character of Mayfield in the 1930s and 1940s”. Included in the plan was the restoration of “Elladale” to provide a common room where residents of the units could meet, enjoy indoor games such as carpet bowls, or gather for celebrations. Problems with rising damp led to the subsequent rendering of some of the stonework and provision of an extensive drainage system.

In the following year a further consolidation took place with the purchase of the land owned by the surviving partners of Dodds’ patternmaking business. This final purchase saw the creation of the site now occupied by the “Elladale” Housing Estate.

27 Certificates of Title Vol.10083, Fols.159 & 160, 13 August 1965; Vol.6862, Fol.63, 17 Sept. 1954: NSW LTO.
28 Certificates of Title Vol.2598 Fol.249, 20 August 1915; Vol.2799 Fol.140, 30 October 1917, NSW LTO.
29 *Newcastle Sun*, 1 June 1971.
2.7 Conclusion

“Elladale” is an historically significant building, being one of the earliest surviving homes to have been built in the emerging suburb of Waratah. Stone from nearby quarries was used in the construction of the house. Although its gardens have been overtaken by urban sprawl, its outbuildings and rear wing have been demolished and the interior of the house is now little more than a shell, “Elladale” still provides evidence of building techniques of the late 1860s and insights into domestic life of that period. The house has links to significant local identities who played a role in shaping the development of the area.

“Elladale” has witnessed the transition of its surrounding area from a rural domestic environment to a more mixed land usage incorporating residential, light industrial/commercial land usage. The house became part of that transition in the early 1900s when it was closely linked to Harry Dodds’ patternmaking business, and again in the late 1950s when it underwent a change of use from residential to office accommodation, thereby adding another dimension to its historical significance.

Threatened with demolition in the 1970s, “Elladale” survived due to change of plans by the owners at that time. Its use as a community centre following redevelopment of the site for

Figure 12

DP 806145, prepared on 7 March 1990 showing the final re-consolidation of properties owned by the Dodds family together with an adjoining property to the east. source: NSW LPI
public housing added yet another level of historical significance to “Elladale”. Now largely obscured from view by surrounding buildings, the old house stands as a defiant reminder of its past glory and a time when Waratah was a semi-rural residential area inhabited by the more wealthy members of the Newcastle community.
3 Existing Fabric

3.1 Context

The immediate context of "Elladale" is medium density public housing, in several multi-unit single and double storey forms and occupying a large allotment between Maitland Road and Waratah Street. There are some commercial buildings nearby on Maitland Road, however the greater context is predominantly residential.

![View from the western verandah of "Elladale" looking toward public housing units on the site.](image)

The 1980s public housing that surrounds "Elladale" is constructed in a simple form and materials palette, each block of units being of a rectangular footprint with gable roofs. Most are single storey. The double storey units fronting Maitland Road are in the same style, with the addition of skillion verandahs. The materials consist of a simple red brick, aluminium windows and concrete roof tiles.

![View of the south western corner of "Elladale".](image)
3.2 Existing Landscape

"Elladale" retains a small section of turf around its southern, eastern and western sides, however this does not offer any impression of the original landscape. The northern (front) façade of the cottage is abutted with a paved masonry unit pathway and brick retaining wall that offers access to the higher level of the Maitland Road units. This surface is higher than original ground level at this point, creating an uncomfortable junction at the original front steps to "Elladale".

Small concrete footpaths run in front of the unit blocks, and a few timber park bench-style seats are positioned around the grounds.

Generally, the landscape is barren.
3.3 External Fabric

The dwelling known as "Elladale" is constructed of a sandstone, in a "rubble stone" laying technique with ashlar stones at the corners, in a non-decorative form. The stone is believed to be sourced from nearby Waratah. A generous verandah presents to the front and halfway around the two sides of the essentially square footprint. The timber verandah is supported by large stone columns, and has a timber boarded floor surface and timber balustrade. The timber components are a recent construction. The verandah ceiling is lined with timber boarding, and painted in a traditional eau-de-nil colour.

The fenestration to the front of the dwelling takes the form of tall French doors with highlights, while the front door set makes a grand statement with sidelights and highlight. The front rooms open to the side verandahs with matching French doors. The central corridor of the dwelling leads to a rear porch (now demolished). The rear corners of the structure are currently service areas, also built of stone but occupying the would-be verandah spaces.

The roof is a series of hips and valleys, and with a decorative gable over the front entrance. Two stone chimneys are extant.

The rear of the dwelling has evidence of a former wing, on the south east side.

The style of "Elladale" can be classed as Victorian Georgian. 'The Georgian (Old Colonial Georgian) style was the basis for most architecture in Australia from the time of the first European settlements until at least the middle of the nineteenth century. The style was adopted.
by the designers of public buildings, of houses for all classes of society, and of utilitarian structures...The Victorian Georgian style was an extension of Old Colonial Georgian, and it continued to emphasise unforced symmetry, a gentle sense of harmony and 'reasonable' proportions.'31 "Elladale" exhibits the Victorian Georgian style through its symmetrical façade, exposed stone walling, fanlights, and French style openings.

Much of the external fabric has been altered from original - likely during the period of construction associated with the Department of Housing development - with new roof tiles (original appears to have been timber shingles), verandah flooring and balustrading, gable infill and general roof plumbing and trims, and the front door. The stonework has also been extensively repaired and replaced.

A document prepared in 2005 by CoAssociates Pty Ltd refers to a structural investigation of "Elladale", noting sandstone walls with internal sandstock brickwork is 'unlikely to have conventional footings, and that most likely the sandstone was built directly onto natural grade, probably with wide sandstone blocks laid as a bottom course.'32

The rear shows window alterations where openings have been infilled with stone or brick.

3.4 Internal Fabric

The interior of "Elladale" has undergone changes that are readily evident in the fabric, and upon entry through the front door are immediately noted by the absence of the formal central hallway form typical of this Victorian Georgian style. On close inspection, much of the joinery has also been reconstructed, and an Art Nouveau style hallway arch with pedestals marks the entry into the rear section of the house. The Georgian style of hallway arch was typically a reconstruction of a classic masonry arch, and would be the style expected at the time "Elladale" was constructed. The later joinery could be the work of Harry Dodds, whose ownership of "Elladale" coincides with his ownership of the patternmaking business H. Dodds & Co., and which operated from the southern side of the site, fronting Waratah Street.

The flooring is timber on a timber structure, although is extensively missing. Walls are rendered and painted with picture rails, and ceilings appear to be plasterboard. Some cornices are elaborate and appear original, while others are modern plaster scotia moulds. Original fabric can be seen in the verandah doors and architraves, some cornice, some internal doors, and two fireplaces. The majority of timber skirting has been removed.

Figure 20
One of two relatively intact fireplaces.

Figure 21, above
North western room.

Figure 22, right
View from the front entrance showing new front door at left, and 20th century hallway arch beyond. Note the lack of detail on the ceiling.
3.5 Condition

The 2005 report by CoAssociates describes the building in a poor state of repair, which is still the case. The fabric has suffered from extreme damp issues, likely caused in part by the change in ground levels to facilitate construction of the surrounding public housing in the 1980s. The recent installation of a subsurface drainage system and ventilation strategy does not appear to have been a complete success.

The interior wall render has been extensively damaged from this continual moisture problem, and extensive peeling ceiling paint and collapsed ceilings are evidence of a leaking roof.

The moisture problem is unlikely to be resolved without substantial site level remediation.

Figure 23
Damp damage evident in the south eastern room.
4 Existing Listings

Newcastle Local Environmental Plan (2012) lists the place as a heritage item of local significance.

"Elladale" is classified by the National Trust of Australia (NSW).

The place is not known to be listed on any other statutory or non-statutory heritage lists.
5 Comparative Examples

5.1 Overview

By comparing places of similar age, style, and scale the relative rarity or representativeness of an item can be more confidently determined. Such an analysis is based on the assessment criteria given by the NSW OEH, Heritage Branch related to rarity and representativeness, and on knowledge of existing similar places.

The following examples are given as comparable examples of "Elladale", however is based on readily available property information for each. Information is taken directly from existing listings at www.heritage.nsw.gov.au. A full study of each comparable property is outside the limits of this HIS.

5.2 Comparative Places

92 Station Street, Waratah (date unknown)
Single storey, faced with stone, simple colonial style. The verandah has elaborate cast iron lacework and stone flagging on the floor. Two projecting chimneys. Mortar contains seashell fragments. Weatherboard additions at rear. Example of simple colonial design now rare in Newcastle. (image, Google Street View)

64 Industrial Drive, Mayfield (c1852)
This single storey Victorian stone cottage is also known also as Simpson's Cottage, due to its association with Simpson, a customs officer at Newcastle. (image, Google Street View)
94 Margaret Street, Mayfield (date unknown)
A single storey building with rough stone masonry and infilled front verandah with timber framed windows and timber weatherboards. Dominant roof predominantly hipped with terracotta tiles and rough cast and chimneys with decorative roof tops.

Representative of the former practice of senior management of the nearby BHP Steelworks, living in company houses. These houses acted as show pieces for the company and illustrated the importance of the staff who lived in them. An important element within the streetscape. (image, Google Street View)

47 Crebert Street, Mayfield (c1914)
Part of the Ingall House group, a single storey dwelling built by BHP from dressed sandstone that came from the home "Duckenfield", which was demolished in 1916. The group has been listed for its streetscape value which is enhanced by the large area of open space around the houses and between #47 and #51. (image, Google Street View)

15 Percy Street, North Lambton (date unknown)
This stone cottage is also known as Quarryman's Cottage, and was rebuilt in the 1980s to the original plan and form. The whimsical decoration was added at that time. The item is significant as the house built for and lived in by the quarry man. (image, Google Street View)
288 Newcastle Road, North Lambton (date unknown)
There were numerous hotels in this area during the late 19th century, servicing the workers from the coal mines and stone quarries in the area. The building is significant in demonstrating the patterns of development of the early townships and is of aesthetic interest, along with 298 Newcastle Road and the Percy Street cottage, being built of face stonework, a relatively unusual material for small scale buildings in Newcastle such as these. (image, Google Street View)

64-66 Howe Street, Lambton (1890)
The home was built as a miner's cottage and was extensively restored in the late 1970s when additional rooms were added to the rear. Leadlight windows and exposed beams and trusses are from the old Cohen's Warehouse building in Bolton Street, Newcastle. Two storey stone building with added dormer facing street. (image, Google Street View)

5.3 Summary
There exists several comparative stone dwellings within the Newcastle Local Government Area and which are protected under LEP heritage listing. Although of varying (and unknown) dates, the majority of these examples remain in their original residential use and in their original, or near original, curtilage. Although not directly inspected, each of these examples also appear to be in much better condition than "Elladale".

This brief comparative overview demonstrates that "Elladale" was a dwelling of common style and material when it was constructed in the late 1860s. Although presently in very poor condition with an original curtilage severely diminished by later development, the structure remains as one of the earliest remaining examples of its type in Mayfield.
6 Significance Assessment

6.1 Assessment

The NSW heritage assessment guidelines broadly encompass four possible values of heritage significance:

1. historical significance,
2. aesthetic significance,
3. research/technical significance, and
4. social significance.

These four values are encompassed into a list of seven more detailed assessment criteria which specifically address key areas of possible significance. An item will be considered to be of significance if it meets one or more of the following criteria.

Historical Significance

Criterion (a) An item is important in the course, or pattern, of the local area’s cultural or natural history.

- "Elladale" is a remnant of the original development pattern of Mayfield, as a substantial family home on a large block, set back from the street and surrounded by gardens.

- "Elladale" is believed to be one of the earliest remaining homes in Mayfield.

Criterion (b) An item has strong or special association with the life or work of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the local area’s cultural or natural history.

- The place is associated with several Newcastle businesses/men - William Petherbridge (manager, Tooth & Co.), Harry Dodds (Dodds + Co. patternmakers), and the Young & Green motor dealership.

Aesthetic Significance

Criterion (c) An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area.

- The place is notable as a substantial stone residence, although this is diminished by its extremely compromised curtilage.
Social Significance

Criterion (d) An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.

- The place does not meet the criteria for inclusion under this category.

Research/Technical Significance

Criterion (e) An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the local area’s cultural or natural history.

- A documentation of the rising damp system, and its subsequent failure may be of interest, particularly opportune during the proposed deconstruction works.

Rarity

Criterion (f) An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the local area’s cultural or natural history.

- While the original form and fabric of "Elladale" can be considered rare, alterations, loss of fabric, and loss of curtilage diminish the integrity of the place.

Representativeness

Criterion (g) An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of the local area’s cultural or natural places, or cultural or natural environments.

- The place does not meet the criteria for inclusion under this category.
7 Statement of Significance

The dwelling known as "Elladale" was constructed in c1869 for local businessman William Petherbridge, and is considered of historical significance as one of the earliest surviving homes to have been built in the emerging but semi-rural suburb of Waratah. The dwelling was later occupied by local patternmaker Harry Dodds and his family, and who also established his business on the southern section of the site (H. Dodds & Co). The Young & Green motor dealership later used the dwelling for commercial premises, in the period of the newly constructed and adjacent Ampol Service Station.

Despite its varied uses as a commercial office and a community centre, "Elladale" contains some fabric remnants demonstrating the building techniques of the early to mid-Victorian period, such as stonework, joinery and fireplaces. The place also holds some technical value for its potential to reveal information on past damp and moisture arresting techniques.

While the original form and fabric of "Elladale" can be considered rare, its current loss of fabric and curtilage have diminished the integrity of the place. The existing condition of "Elladale" is poor.
8 Statement of Heritage Impact

This is a statement of heritage impact for:

Proposed partial deconstruction of the building known as "Elladale", located at 358 Maitland Road, Mayfield, NSW, with property description Lot 1, DP 806145.

Date:
November 2013

Reference:
The former dwelling "Elladale" is a heritage item of local significance, defined under the Newcastle Local Environmental Plan 2012.

The material upon which this statement has been based:
• The University of Newcastle, Deconstructing Elladale, 4 sheets

Prepared by:
Heritas Architecture (Linda Babic, B.A., B.Arch., M.Herit.Cons.)
173 Russell Road, New Lambton, NSW 2305, (ph) 4957 8003.

Prepared for:
Department of Family & Community Services, Northern Region - Housing NSW, Moonee Street, Coffs Harbour NSW 2450.

The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item for the following reasons:

• The proposal allows for the retention, albeit partial, of "Elladale".

• As an urban design proposal, it merges the need to conserve heritage places and to create new places for people. It has and will continue to engage the surrounding residents not only in creating their own space, but in the conservation of Newcastle's heritage.

• The proposal will offer custodianship to "Elladale" over time as it is actively managed by the Department of Housing and actively cared for by the residents surrounding it.

• The proposal will re-use deconstructed building fabric in landscaping items, supporting the recognition of the evolution of the site and the social aspects of urban living.

• While not suitable/feasible as a dwelling in the existing social dynamic of the site, the proposal retains the skeletal form of "Elladale".
• The proposed use is in the character of past uses as a residence and community centre, and is considered appropriate for the greater site.

• The retention and continuing use of the site for community housing is appropriate.

• The place has a history of adaptation to accommodate new uses.

• The proposed use is in line with the conservation recommendation set out in the 2005 Heritage Conservation Strategy of 'continued maintenance of the building to enable continued use of activities related to the site and by owners/authorities.' The proposed deconstruction will bring the place back into a usable form by the surrounding residents, and essentially continue its past use as a community centre, but in a different form.

The following aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on the heritage significance of the item:

• The removal of large sections of fabric lessens the interpretive value of the place, however it must be recognised that full reconstruction is highly unlikely to ever happen.

The following sympathetic solutions have been considered and discounted for the following reasons:

• Reconstruction of the former dwelling has been considered, however discounted due to costs necessary to return the fabric to a usable state. The poor condition due to ongoing water issues, along with the size and position of the building at the focus of surrounding residential units make the place unsuitable for residential accommodation. Community hall-type use has been unsuccessful in the past, and therefore does not present a feasible re-use.

The following recommendations are made:

• Original fabric that is not re-used in the proposal should be recycled (through a commercial yard, for instance).

• The deconstruction should be documented through archival photographs, which are cross-referenced to the measured drawing produced by CoAssociates, July 2005.
**Summary**

Based on the available documentary and extant physical evidence, the proposal for the partial deconstruction and adaptive re-use of "Elladale" is considered sympathetic. The evolution of the property - from family home to office accommodation to community centre and now to proposed community garden/relic - should be recognised in this instance as a legitimate method of conservation. This approach has been highly successful in other heritage places, most notably at the former Paddington Reservoir site in Sydney.

The proposed conservation of the place as an adaptively re-used and re-imagined relic is warranted, in consideration of the extremely poor condition of the place and the projected engagement the proposal will provide to Department of Housing residents at the site. The social benefits that this proposal presents should not be underestimated - social benefits that will contribute to a greater understanding of heritage value by the community.