Former Australian Agricultural Company Head Office
Argyle House
Newcastle

STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

North eastern view of the building group

Proposed alterations
at
Fanny’s Nightclub,
311 Wharf Road,
Newcastle

September 2012

Prepared by Elizabeth Evans
Reviewed by Stephen Booker
Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION — BASIS OF ASSESSMENT 3
   2. PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION 4
      BUILDING 1 ORIGINAL BUILDING – 1860 5
      BUILDING 2 ADDITION – POSSIBLY MENKENS - PRE1903 6
      BUILDING 3 MENKENS 1903 7
      BUILDING 4 MENKENS AND CASTLEDEN – 1907 7
      BUILDING 5 CASTLEDEN - 1909 7
      BUILDING 6 MENKENS AND CASTLEDEN – 1912 8
      BUILDING 7 CASTLEDEN – 1912 8
      BUILDING 8 CASTLEDEN – 1919 8
      BUILDING 9 TOILETS 8
      BUILDING 10 FORMER COURTYARD 9
      BUILDING 11 9
      BUILDING 12 9
3. ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE 10
4. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE 11
5. THE PROPOSAL 12
6. FABRIC ASSESSMENT 13
7. ASSESSMENT OF IMPACTS 14
8. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 22
1. INTRODUCTION — BASIS OF ASSESSMENT

carste STUDIO has been engaged by Greg Mathew and Russell Richardson of Fanny’s Nightclub to prepare a Statement of Heritage Impact to accompany a development application (DA) for internal and external alterations and conservation work to the nightclub.

This report adopts the methodology outlined in the *Heritage Assessments and Statements of Heritage Impact* (prepared by the Heritage Office and the Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, 1996.) It has been undertaken in accordance with the principles of the *Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance*, 1999.

The Statement of Heritage Impact was prepared by Elizabeth Evans, Heritage Consultant and Stephen Booker, Director of carste Studio, reviewed the report.

The site was initially inspected by Stephen Booker and Elizabeth Evans on the 5th September and the 18th September 2012.

The subject site includes a group of buildings that formed the offices of the Australian Agricultural Company.

The historical basis of this report and assessment of significance is based on the research for the Conservation Management Strategy prepared by carste STUDIO in September 2012 for this development application.
Figure 1 Location Plan
source: Google Maps
2. PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION

The group of buildings, arranged as pavilions, are the result of a sequence of buildings designed by Frederick Menkens and the offices of Castleden and Menkens. The layout of the early buildings on the site are as shown in Figure 2. A plan showing the heritage layering is included in Appendix A.

![Figure 2: Map of the AA Co's site at Wharf Road. Argyle House (former AA Coy headquarters) - extract from Lands Dept survey map, 1896](image)

This complex of buildings has grown over about 150 years. The original building is believed to date from the 1860s. A second building, joined by a covered way, was designed by Frederick Menkens and built in 1903. Additions to this second building were designed by Menkens and F G Castleden in 1907 and by Castleden in 1909 and 1919. Castleden also designed a third essentially separate building in 1912.

Recent flat roofed additions on the southern side of the building group provides additional accommodation for the nightclub. A caretaker's cottage to the west of the existing buildings, designed by Castleden in 1912, was demolished c1970.

List of buildings which are part of the group of buildings that makes up the present day Fannys:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building</th>
<th>Date of construction</th>
<th>Description/ Architect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>c1860</td>
<td>Original Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>pre-1903</td>
<td>Addition – Possibly Menkens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1903</td>
<td>Menkens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1907</td>
<td>Menkens and Castleden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1909</td>
<td>Castleden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1912</td>
<td>Castleden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1912- c1970 (demolished)</td>
<td>Caretakers Cottage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1919</td>
<td>Castleden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>toilets date unknown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>former courtyard</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For a more detailed physical description refer to the Conservation Management Strategy prepared by carste STUDIO, September 2012, for this development application.
Building 1  Original Building – c1860
A single storey hipped roof structure of brick construction, rendered and painted with terracotta tiled roof. There is a palisade fence surrounding the verandah which varies in detail. Victorian Georgian style originally symmetrically designed with encircling verandah. Photographic evidence from the 1880s (Figure 3) shows the original roof to be galvanised iron and a flagpole finial detail on the central gable on Argyle Street. Also evident is the striped paint on the verandah roof.

Alterations and additions to the exterior and interior have resulted in the removal of some earlier building fabric and accretions to the building obscure its original style and symmetry. The interior has been altered with removal of original walls and new fabric that obscures original extant fabric. The exterior as viewed from Argyle and Wharf Streets has the potential to display the original building.

Building 2  Addition – Possibly Menkens - pre1903
The is a masonry building with hipped and gabled roof structure built as an attached addition to the original 1860s building. It is a masonry structure with a terracotta roof. This building was designed to be accessible by the western verandah. It is currently used as a separate bar space.

The french doors, hardware and joinery and highlight windows are extant. The highlight glazing is original glass and glazed panels in the door are a later date.

Original skirtings are evident.

Timber chimney piece and grate are still existing.

Ornate wall vents are extant.
The large opening on the western wall is an alteration. A timber lintel evident in the attic space indicates the area of original door on the western wall.

Timber floor is concealed with carpet over.

Original ceiling may be extant above later ceiling.

Door opening on the south wall appears to be a later opening with new architraves.

**Building 3  Menkens 1903**
This is a masonry building with a hipped roof structure clad in terracotta and added to the earlier building (Building 2, pre 1903). This building is currently used for male and female toilets, storage and circulation area. The area of this building that fronts the street on Centenary Road is an addition also by Castleden dated as 1909 (refer to Building 5).

Much of the original fabric is concealed and all original doors have been removed and new larger openings have been made. An original arch in the attic area of the northern wall indicates the location of a door with highlight window.

This attic area also provides evidence of the northern wall of the original building, potential paint scraping and the soffit linings. The markings of the original rafter indicates the area of the original north verandah.

Walls and floors are generally lined with new fabric and conceal original finishes. The ceiling in the Female Toilets is v-jointed timber boarding with a painted finish. Cast iron wall vents are evident in this room.

A cupboard located on the west wall displays earlier tiles in a brick pattern. This indicates this area was used for toilets or other utilitarian purpose.

**Building 4  Menkens and Castleden – 1907**
This is a masonry construction with solid walls approximately 1 metre in thickness and a hipped roof clad with terracotta. The area was originally used as a Strong Room and was accessible from Building 3.

The existing door opening on the east wall of the Strong Room is likely to be original. The original door has been removed. A sandstone lintel on the external western wall of the Strong Room marks the location of an original door opening that has been bricked up.

The walls have been finished with battens and gyprock which according to the current occupants conceals a tiled wall.

The exterior western wall is rendered and painted and includes wall vents.

All gutters are colorbond quad and downpipes are circular diameter PVC.

**Building 5  Castleden - 1909**
This is an extension to Building 3 and appears to be similar in construction with the hip form of the roof continuing. The internal alteration in wall thickness on the eastern wall indicates the location of the earlier and later building.

Much of the original fabric is concealed and all original doors have been removed and new larger openings have been made.
Two original windows are extant on the south elevation. These are double hung with simple horns and have new glass panes.

**Building 6  Menkens and Castleden – 1912**
Built as a masonry construction with a hipped roof and large double hung windows addressing Wharf Road. The configuration of this space with its double fireplace indicates the use of this space as an office. The ceiling indicates the area of a former wall that bisected the space in the centre of the double chimney.

The east room originally contained two separate door openings for french doors. One of these doors, the highlight and hardware is extant. The original glass may also be extant under the recent decorative transfers. The second door has been removed though the highlight and architraves are extant.

The windows are double hung and are blocked internally to provide acoustic insulation.

Skirtings are moulded timber and a variation in moulding is evident in the two rooms.

The dado may be a more recent decorative feature.

Ceilings vary in each room. The east room has a later plaster ceiling with a cornice that appears to date from the 1940s. The west room retains its original v-jointed timber ceiling. A light switch for a pull cord is evident.

The chimney piece and grate are extant (though the grate is blocked in the east room) and the hearths for each may be concealed under the carpet. The chimney piece is a stylised design with Art Nouveau features.

**Building 7  Castleden – 1912**
Originally used as the Caretakers Cottage. This building was demolished in c1970.

**Building 8  Castleden – 1919**
This is a masonry construction with a hipped roof clad in terracotta. This addition is connected to the Strong Room, Building 4, and there may have been access to the latter area though there is no evidence of a former door.

The exterior is rendered and painted with bosses on the north elevation indicating the location of a former awning. All original doors and windows have been removed. The western wall contains a number of wall vents which are also evident on the eastern wall. The latter wall previously faced a courtyard which is now enclosed as an interior space. The eastern wall has been altered with a large opening supported by a steel column and beam which is boxed in.

All internal walls are rendered and painted and include a dado rail of moulded timber. A section of wall located on the north-west retains an earlier colour scheme.

The floor is bitumen coated and in sections where the upper surface has worn, tiles are evident beneath.

A new fire exit door has been built on the northern street frontage.

**Building 9  Toilets**
This is a modern brick construction with a flat roof. This may have been the location of earlier toilets though there is no evidence of this earlier structure. A door D9 providing access to a store room retains an early moulded timber architrave that may have been reused as the brick wall is recen. The door D9 is new.
Building 10  Former Courtyard
The former courtyard areas have all been infilled for use as internal space. These areas are timber framed roof construction and generally use existing walls and new brick walls on some areas. The roof is flat and clad with colorbond with a modern bullnose. The floor is a hard surface with carpet over.

A new brick wall has been constructed as the east wall of the former courtyard for the new Toilets, Building 9.

A brick wall has also been constructed on the north elevation of the former courtyard on Wharf Road. This north elevation includes a large glazed area with two double hung windows and a fixed central window. The windows have been blocked out internally for acoustic insulation. There is a door opening to the street with a paneled door and highlight which may be recycled fabric. In front of this north wall to the building is located a brick and cement rendered plinth that indicates the location of a former palisade fence.

Building 11
This is a modern addition that adjoins the original 1860s building and later Building 2, 3 and 5. This addition resulted in the loss of original fabric from all of the latter buildings. It is a masonry construction on a concrete slab with rendered and painted external walls and a colorbond roof with bullnose end.

Building 12
Similarly to Building 12, this is a modern addition that adjoins earlier buildings which include Building 5, 3 and the Strong Room Building 4. Its construction resulted in the demolition and alteration of original fabric to adjoining walls and roof areas. It is a masonry building with rendered and painted external walls and a colorbond roof. There is a parapet wall on the west elevation.

From the Google Earth image in Figure 2, essentially, all areas with a pitched roof are over earlier AA Coy premises including the verandah on the north and east corner of Wharf Road and Argyle Street.
Those that have low pitched steel roofs, are post AA Coy and are of no significance or intrusive elements.

### 3. ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The assessment of significance is from the Conservation Management Strategy prepared by carste STUDIO in September 2012:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical significance</th>
<th>The building is a record of the Australian Agricultural Company and the importance of Newcastle in the economic success of this company in the mining and export of coal from Newcastle and the Hunter. The use of this building as the main office of the AA Coy from c1860 to 1965 represents the prosperous period of development of coal mining and the expansion of the company from Newcastle to the South Maitland Coal fields. The location of the building records the history of this precinct, the Newcastle Foreshore, The Hill and Newcastle Harbour in association with the industrial and economic development of the AA Coy. The former Argyle House was located within the industrial hub of the AA Coy and from here the managers could oversee the coal pits (until their closure in 1918) the transporting of coal from the Newcastle pits and later from the South Maitland Coal fields and the loading and exporting of coal. The stages of development of the AA Coy office records the growth of the AA Coy and the requirement for a larger Strong Room and expanded office space.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Historical association significance</td>
<td>The extensions to the former Argyle House are associated with the prominent architects Menkens and Castleden both as sole practising architects and in partnership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic significance</td>
<td>The former Argyle House is representative of a building in the Victorian Georgian style. The notable features of the original buildings which remain include the verandah roof framing, cast-iron verandah posts and decoration, cast iron picket fence (altered), window and door joinery and fanlights, original skirtings, plaster and lath ceilings and cornices and chimney pieces. The building is a prominent building on the corner Wharf Road and Argyle Streets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social significance</td>
<td>The building was used until the 1960s as the office of the AA Coy and therefore its importance is likely to be known and recognised by senior members of the Newcastle community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rarity</td>
<td>The former Argyle House and its later extensions for use by the AA Coy are rare surviving built evidence of the AA Coy in Newcastle. 2006 assessment by Lester Tropman: Related heritage places which add to the AA Coy story are the former D Pit Mine Manager’s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[carste STUDIO pty ltd] [September 2012]
residence at Denison Street Hamilton (residence of the AA Coy from 1848-191.) (2173869); the remnants of the C Pit winding shaft, now St Ronan’s residence at 18 Binlge Street The Hill (2173981, 2171840), and the remnant bridge column from the Hunter Street coal rail bridge, Hunter Street Newcastle (2172035).

Integrity

The earlier additions to the building are a part of the history of the building and its layers of use by the AA Coy. The later additions and alterations for tavern and nightclub use have diminished the integrity of the building complex. These later alterations are intrusive and have resulted in removal and concealment of significant fabric.

4. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The statement of significance is from the Conservation Management Strategy prepared by carste STUDIO in September 2012:

Fanny's Nightclub, formally “Argyle House” was originally the head offices of arguably Australia’s largest and most successful company, the Australian Agricultural Company, incorporated by Act of Parliament in 1824. Though its charter was controversial in its extent providing a monopoly over convict labour, land and coal mining, and was famously challenged by James Brown amongst others, the AA Company did succeed in industrial and business ventures that included sheep and wool, coal and subdivision of the vast quantities of crown land. The building is a record of the AA Coy and the importance of Newcastle in the economic success of this company in the mining and export of coal from both Newcastle and the South Maitland Coal fields, and represents a prosperous period for the AA Coy in coal mining.

Argyle House was built in the 1860s and is to this day is a prominent building on the corner of Wharf Road and Argyle Streets. The Victorian Georgian style building is distinguishable in this view from Wharf Road and retains the verandah and cast iron filigree work and columns. Also evident are the later numerous extensions dating from 1903 to 1919 designed by Menkens and Castleden, well known and prolific architects in the Newcastle and the Hunter. The building remained as the main office for the AA Coy until its sale in 1967 and the relocation of the AA Coy head office to Tamworth in 1969. Though altered with later accretions for nightclub use, with its change of use to Fanny’s tavern and then a nightclub after its sale, it does retain some of its external architectural value and remnant internal features. There is the potential to interpret the remaining streetscape importance and internal building fabric.

The location of the building records the history of this precinct, the Newcastle Foreshore, The Hill and Newcastle Harbour in association with the industrial and economic development of the AA Coy. This precinct was once the industrial hub of the AA Coy and from here the managers could oversee the coal staiths (until their closure in 1918) the transporting of coal from the Newcastle and South Maitland Coal fields and the loading and exporting of coal from the wharves.

The former Argyle House and its later extensions for use by the AA Coy are rare surviving built evidence of the AA Coy in Newcastle. One surviving building includes the Mine Managers House at Hamilton (residence of the AA Coy from 1848-1914.) Members of the Newcastle community lobbied to conserve the Argyle House group as a museum in the 1960s and whilst its use has altered there are senior members in the community that would value its former use.
5. THE PROPOSAL

The Conservation Management Strategy, Floor Plan and Elevation drawings prepared by carste STUDIO have been used in this impact assessment and include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Drawing No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DA01</td>
<td>Existing Plan</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA02</td>
<td>Demolition Plan</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA03</td>
<td>Renovation Plan</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA04</td>
<td>Roof Plan</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA05</td>
<td>Elevations and Sections</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA06</td>
<td>Heritage Layering</td>
<td>28/09/12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Report: Conservation Management Strategy 20/09/12

**note:** A plan showing the heritage layering, buildings and significant doors and windows is included in Appendix A.

The proposed work includes:

Building Complex – all buildings

- Repair roof tiles and roof sheeting and all flashings where water penetrating.
- Replace all corroded gutters and downpipes with colorbond in Shale Grey and profile as recommended in the Conservation Management Strategy by carste STUDIO.
- Assessment by an engineer of the roof structure and installation of secondary roof members where required.
- Repaint exterior.

Building 1 (refer to Appendix A for key to building numbers and doors and windows)

- Construct new Poker Machine Area with a stud wall to the underside of the suspended ceiling, lined with plasterboard and with a new payout window.
- Construct new bar area with bar, wash area and new plasterboard walls to the underside of the suspended ceiling.
- New sound lock door.
- The arched opening 01 squared up.
- Timber column on east external verandah replaced with original cast iron column currently located in western corridor (corridor 1).
- Air conditioning duct to be boxed in.
- Retain original colour layers in corridor (corridor 2), analyse and paint in original colours.
- Demolish stud wall and compressed fibre linings infilling the verandah on the east, brick up door D3 and open up original verandah.
- Remove recent section of palisade fence on the north and retention of the earlier palisade. Remove later paving and new landscape treatment.

Building 2

- Remove existing bar and install banquet seating. Install new plasterboard partitions to south wall to height of existing plasterboard ceiling.
- Remove door D17 and leave as door opening.

Building 3 and Building 5

- Remove toilet fixtures in Female Toilets and construct new bar area with new plasterboard walls.
- Construct new walls in opening 03 in acoustic paneling within the brick opening.
- New door opening to Male and Female Toilets.
- Construct new store room and new disabled toilet with new plasterboard walls to height of suspended ceiling.
Building 4
- Construct new airlock entrance to the Smoking Area and plasterboard walls.

Building 6
- Remove Bar Areas and construct new Male and Female Toilets.
- Cavity wall bricked in with straight joints either side and highlight window above left exposed. D12 is a new fire exit within an existing opening with original highlight and joinery.
- Construct new inner stud wall to allow for plumbing duct for toilet and construct new stud wall partition between the Male and Female Toilets.
- Two new door openings to be constructed for entry to the Male and Female Toilets.
- All original door and window openings to be fixed, concealed and retained as openings for future use if required.
- The existing chimneys and chimney pieces will be retained and able to be viewed in the wash room areas.

Building 8
- Construct new Bar Area and Store Room with new plasterboard walls to the underside of the ceiling.
- Demolish boxing to the beam in opening 04. Retain the original brick walls including walls above the opening 04 and vents.

Building 9
- Demolish original toilets and construct new Dining Area, Air Lock and Cleaners Cupboard. Construct new banquet seating and new plasterboard walls to existing ceiling height. Remove door D09 and retain original architrave to door D9.

Building 10
- Construct new coffered ceiling with rim lighting. Demolish existing external north wall, door D14 and window W12 and replace with new fire exit door. Build new external brick wall and new internal acoustic wall and sound lock to exit doors.

Building 11
- Construct new Smoking Area in existing stage area and remove roof.
- Construct a new awning over the footpath

Building 12
- Construct new smoking area and remove roof.

6. FABRIC ASSESSMENT

The building fabric, elements and parts of the building that must be conserved have been itemised in detail and given a significance rating in the Conservation Management Strategy prepared by carste STUDIO. Those parts of the building that can be altered have also been assessed in the Strategy.

General Comments
The interior of the building is highly altered and adapted with a large amount of the original detailed finishes removed or obscured.

A number of walls of earlier buildings have been removed, whilst the outside roof form of the individual buildings has been retained which defines each separate building. A great amount of change has been undertaken inside the building to form the large unobstructed spaces now evident, particularly the
removal of part of the west and all of the south wall of Building 1 which is the earliest building on the site.

7. ASSESSMENT OF IMPACTS

7.1 Identification of Impacts
Potential impacts arising from the proposed development include:

- demolition of original elements;
- intervention in remaining significant fabric; and
- further loss of the remaining interpretative value of the internal spaces through new construction.

To retain the facility in a viable condition, the owners must respond to market forces and amendments and changes to legislation. Fanny’s is a popular nightclub and the building has been altered and adapted for this use, however in balance, the existing group of buildings are an important record of the history of the AA Coy and the industrial history of Newcastle foreshore.

This Assessment of Impact analyses the extent of these potential impacts and the measures taken to mitigate these impacts.

*note:* A plan showing the heritage layering, buildings and significant doors and windows is included in Appendix A.

7.2 Impact of new work to Building 1
(refer to Appendix A for plan showing location of buildings and significant doors and windows)

The enclosed eastern verandah is proposed to be removed and the original fabric retained. The verandah infill on the east is intrusive and the removal of this fabric will reveal the original Victorian Georgian form of the Argyle House as viewed from Wharf Road and Argyle Street. The recent stud wall and fibre cement linings and door D3 will be demolished and the cast iron valance and columns retained. It is also proposed to reconstruct the verandah return to the south-east which is currently crudely terminated. The timber column on east external verandah will be replaced with an original cast iron column that is currently located in the internal western corridor of Building 1. The work will require some reconstruction such as repair of the timber floor, timber plates to the verandah edge and treatment and repainting of cast iron to prevent further deterioration. The pavers which are an intrusive element are proposed to be replaced with a mulch or more appropriate paving at a lower level.

*Figure 5* View of eastern enclosed verandah on Argyle Street.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

*Figure 6* View on Argyle Street, east, showing original palisade to be retained and brick paving and tree stumps proposed to be removed.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012
The rendered external wall will be repainted in a suitable Victorian colour such as yellow ochre, biscuit or salmon. The recommended choice of wall colours for Building 1 are Solver Pale Biscuit (yellow ochre), Solver Light Earth (drab), Solver Kirribilli (salmon). The colours of the cast iron and fascia should be determined by a paint scrape. The remainder will be a neutral grey colour.

The palisade fence on the north is a recent fence and its fixing to the columns is causing corrosion. This later palisade fence is proposed to be removed and the original eastern fence will be retained.

The new work for a Poker Room is all reversible and significant fabric is not proposed to be removed. Hence there is the potential to display the existing significant fabric such as skirtings, cornices and ceilings in the future. The new plasterboard walls will extend to the underside of the suspended ceiling and will not be attached to original plaster and lath ceilings. The existing original french door D5 is proposed to be retained and used as the access to the new Poker Room.

---

**Figure 7**
Original palisade fence and gate spear heads proposed to be conserved.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

**Figure 8**
Northern palisade fence proposed to be removed showing later spear heads and crude joint causing corrosion to cast iron verandah posts.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

**Figure 9**
Original french door Door D05 proposed to be used as entrance to new Poker Machine Room
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

**Figure 10**
Original hardware on door D05 that will be retained.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012
The Strong Room will be retained and one arch opening (an intrusive later addition) will be infilled with plasterboard. There is therefore the potential to interpret the use of this significant room in the future.

The New Bar area is proposed to be reversible and will not alter or remove any significant fabric. The plasterboard walls are proposed to terminate at the suspended ceiling and skirtings will not be removed.

The arched opening 01 is a later intrusive element and the proposed squaring up of this feature will indentify this as new work and not mimic earlier openings such as that at door D7. The earlier arched opening at D7 will be retained within a new sound lock.

The earlier layer of colours found in Corridor 2 will be retained and a sample area protected by a glass pane.

The internal work proposed in Building 1 is reversible and will not alter the original fabric. The external work will enhance the Victorian Georgian façade of the building and its importance in the streetscape on the corner of Wharf Road and Argyle Street. Importantly the work provides the potential for the future interpretation of Argyle House.

7.3 Impact of new work to Building 2
The new bars and banquet seating are being constructed above the existing floor and do not rely on the adjacent walls for fixing and support and are constructed over the existing floor finishes.

The new plasterboard wall is proposed in the south wall which will replace a glazed partition wall which is recent fabric. All original walls, skirtings, vents, chimneys and chimney piece and original french doors D8 are to be retained.
Alterations and Conservation Work, 311 Wharf Road, Newcastle
STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

Carste Studio Pty Ltd
September 2012

Door D17 which is proposed to be removed is a recent door and not assessed as significant fabric.

7.4 Impact of new work to Building 3 and 5
The new Bar Area will be constructed above the existing floor and will not alter significant fabric. The toilet fixtures proposed to be removed are all new fixtures. The new plasterboard walls will finish at the existing plasterboard ceiling and therefore will not alter the original timber board ceilings.

The plasterboard walls for the new Store Room and Disabled Toilet will be reversible and will finish at the suspended ceiling and hence will not alter existing fabric.

The proposed new wall within opening 03 will be within the brick opening which is not an original opening and hence will not alter any significant fabric. All evidence in this ceiling space above 03 of the original verandah and eaves details on Building 3 will be retained.

The Male and Female Toilets are to be altered with a new door opening which will require the removal of original masonry to form the door opening. This has been placed within a new bar area and is not within a significant space. It will be identifiable as a new opening. The original timber boarded ceiling and wall vents in the Female Toilet will be retained.

Earlier wall tiles located in the cupboard in Corridor 4 will be retained as this area and will not be altered.

This area has been altered with new Male and Female Toilets and removal of significant fabric such as the chimneys. The original extant fabric which includes masonry walls and v-jointed timber ceilings, is proposed to be retained in the proposed new work.

Figure 13 Original door D08 proposed to be retained
source: Carste Studio Sept 2012

Figure 14 Original chimney, grate and chimney piece proposed to be retained
source: Carste Studio Sept 2012
7.5  Impact of new work to Building 4
No significant fabric will be altered in the original Strong Room which is identified as a significant room. The original surfaces are all concealed below new plasterboard walls and ceiling and the new plasterboard air lock to the smoking room will be fixed to these recent plasterboard walls and not to the original masonry substrate. The proposed new Smoking Room is outside the area of the original Strong Room and will not alter any significant fabric.

The door opening D16 is likely to be original though the joinery and door are not extant. The opening will be retained and the door which is not significant fabric will be removed.

The work proposed in this area is reversible and will not alter the original Strong Room.

7.6  Impact of new work to Building 6
This area is currently used as a bar area and is proposed to be altered for use as Male and Female Toilets. The relocation of the toilets from Building 9 to this area allows for a more functional floor plan with improved circulation public areas and a re-use of Building 9 with public areas grouped together.

An inner stud wall is proposed to be built to provide a concealed duct for plumbing and to conceal and conserve the original walls, windows and joinery W10 and W11. Some penetrations will be required in the floor and ceiling for plumbing and mechanical ventilation and these will be minimised. The toilets will be vented through the ceiling space to the south and vents and will not be visible from Wharf Road.

All original door and window openings are proposed to be fixed, concealed and retained as openings for future use if required. The new inner northern stud wall and plasterboard lining to all openings is proposed to be reversible and no original joinery will be removed or damaged. Door D12 is a new fire exit within an existing opening with an original highlight. This fire exit door is proposed to be bricked up with straight joints (allowing for this to be reversed in the future) and the highlight window and joinery is proposed to be retained.
Two new door openings are to be constructed for entry to the Male and Female Toilets and will require removal of parts of the original masonry walls. These are discreetly placed and do not alter significant spaces such as the original verandahs. These are proposed to be formed in an original wall and will be detailed to be identifiable as new work.

The existing chimneys and chimney pieces will be retained and able to be viewed in the wash room areas.

### 7.7 Impact of new work to Building 8

The new bar will be constructed above the existing floor and will not damage the original tile floor below the bitumen.

The plasterboard walls will finish at the new ceiling level and will not damage any original ceilings above.

The original external walls are proposed to be retained including walls above the opening 04 and wall vents. The moulded dado rail will also be retained. A sample of the original paint colours and layers evident on the western and northern wall will be retained and protected with a glass pane.

---

**Figure 17**
Wall showing earlier colour scheme.
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

**Figure 18**
Bitumen floor with substrate tiled floor
source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012

This area has been altered with the building of a large opening 04 in the original eastern external wall and a new fire escape in the earlier door opening to Wharf Road on the north. There are no extant window openings and it is assumed these were removed when the opening 04 was formed. The proposed work will not alter any significant fabric and will allow for future investigation and interpretation.

### 7.8 Impact of new work to Building 9

This area has been altered and no original fabric was found in our assessment with the exception of the door architrave to D9 and original external walls and chimney. These are proposed to be retained. The western and eastern walls are recent single skin brick walls and are proposed to be replaced with new plasterboard walls.
7.9 Impact of new work to Building 10
This area was originally an open courtyard and the only significant original fabric are the external walls of surrounding buildings and evidence of earlier buildings in the ceiling area. The northern external wall which is proposed to be demolished is new fabric with the exception of D14 which may be a recycled door. This door will be stored for re-use if required.

![Figure 19 brick plinth showing evidence of earlier palisade fence](source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012)

![Figure 20 recycled Door D14 proposed to be removed and stored](source: Carste STUDIO Sept 2012)

The masonry plinth outside the northern wall is evidence of an earlier palisade fence is also significant fabric and will be retained without alteration.

7.10 Impact of new work to Building 11 and Building 12
These are later additions to the group of buildings infilling spaces between buildings. These additions are assessed as intrusive and hence any new work in these areas will not impact on significant fabric. Care will be taken with new work in the ceiling area to retain evidence of earlier buildings and verandahs.
The existing awning is proposed to be removed and a new awning is proposed on Centenary Road to be fixed to the façade of Building 11 to provide shelter for the public when queuing for entrance to the nightclub. This southern façade is all new fabric and hence no significant fabric will be disturbed. The awning is cantilevered with steel supports and a colorbond roof and designed to drain to the existing gutters and downpipes. It is simply detailed and will not be visible from Wharf Road or views from the corner of Wharf Road and Argyle Street and hence will not detract from these significant views of Building 1.

7.11 Summary Heritage Impact Assessment
The following aspects of the proposal could enhance and respect the heritage significance of the buildings, fabric and elements:

- The exposure and restoration of the original verandah on Argyle Street will enhance Building 1 and display its importance on the corner of Wharf Road and Argyle Street and its historical value as the former head office of the AA Coy.
- Painting the building in colours that are appropriate to the style of the original Argyle House. Where possible the colours will be based on a paint scrape. The remainder of the group will be painted in a neutral colour as it is assumed that the later additions by Menkens and Castleden were face brick which was favoured by both architects.
- Retaining all remaining significant fabric including remnants such as deteriorated plaster and lath ceilings, cornices and skirtings allows for future conservation work if in the future it is practical to reveal samples of the original fabric.
- Where significant doors and windows are not to be used these are to be concealed behind wall linings and the joinery is not to be altered or damaged with new fixings.
- Ensuring that all new work is not fixed to significant fabric.
- All the proposed new work is reversible and little or no need for repair will be required to reverse this work in the future. This is the case except for the construction of three new internal door openings to the toilet areas which will require the removal of original masonry and the impact of this has been assessed in this report.
- Proposed maintenance and repair of the group of buildings including the roof repair and drainage will improve the life of the building.

The following aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on the heritage significance of the buildings, fabric and elements:

The main parts of the proposed new work that could have a detrimental impact and the mitigative measures taken include in summary:

- The construction of the new bar areas could have a detrimental impact.
This building has been used since the 1970s as a public bar and nightclub and damage to original fabric occurred previously. This includes the demolition of original walls and alteration of small rooms for use as large public spaces. The new bars are proposed in these existing public areas and will be constructed above existing floors and not be fixed to original walls or significant fabric. New plasterboard walls will be constructed to the height of later suspended ceilings and will be cut around existing skirtings hence no significant fabric will be altered and the work will be reversible.

- The construction of new smoking areas and in particular the Smoking Area adjacent to the Strong Room has the potential to detract from the Strong Room which is a significant space.

The Smoking Room is proposed to be built outside the area of the Strong Room and will use existing openings. The new air lock access proposed within the Strong Room will be constructed in new fabric and will be reversible.

- The alteration of the plan and the relocation of the toilets to Building 6. This requires the blocking of significant existing doors and windows and new door openings in original walls.

Building 6 has been previously altered with the demolition of an internal wall bisecting the space, removal of an original door D12 and blocking and alteration of original windows and doors. All extant windows and doors and joinery are proposed to be retained and to be concealed behind new stud walls and compressed fibre cement linings. This has the potential to be reversed in the future if the use of this space should alter.

The proposed new doors will require the removal of original brickwork to these walls. These are required for the functional planning of the toilets which allows for the retention and display of the chimney and chimney pieces. The doors are proposed to be located discreetly and will be identified as new door openings.

8. **CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The State Heritage Register indicates that Exemptions have been granted to the item under s57(1) of the Heritage Act 1977, on 5th September 2008 by Minister Sartor. Whilst some Exemptions are likely to be granted, the work will have some impacts on significant fabric as assessed in this Statement of Heritage Impact and hence the development should be referred to the NSW Heritage Council for approval.

The Exemptions applicable in this case are:

**Standard Exemption 8: Non Significant fabric.**

1. The following development does not require approval under subsection 57(1) of the Act, provided that the Director-General is satisfied that the criteria in (a) have been met and the person proposing to undertake the development has received a notice advising that the Director-General is satisfied:
   
   (a) the alteration of a building involving the construction or installation of new fabric or services or the removal of building fabric which will not adversely affect the heritage significance of the item.

2. A person proposing to do anything of the kind described in paragraph 1 must write to the Director-General and describe the proposed development. If the Director-General is satisfied that the proposed development meets the criteria set out in paragraph 1(a), the Director-General shall notify the applicant.

A Conservation Management Strategy has been prepared by carste STUDIO to identify the significant buildings, fabric and elements and to provide applied management recommendations for the proposed
continued use of this building as a nightclub and its future conservation. The Strategy identifies the fabric that should be conserved and fabric that could be removed or modified.

The work proposed has been assessed in this Statement of Heritage Impact as generally having minimal impact on significant fabric identified in the Conservation Management Strategy. The building is a complex group of early buildings that are associated with the AA Coy and are identified as significant. Since the sale of this building in 1967 and its use as a public bar and nightclub from the late 1960s to the present, the earlier AA Coy Buildings have undergone a series of changes and diminishing of original fabric. The proposed work aims to impede this loss of fabric, protect significant remaining fabric and to enhance the exterior of the building. Functional requirements for the continued use of this building as a nightclub have required a minimal amount of alteration to earlier masonry walls and some concealment and blocking of earlier windows and doors. This work has been designed to be reversible.

The proposed work has been guided by the Conservation Management Strategy and will conserve what is left, after years of use as a nightclub, of the AA Coy head office. In this case, the Development Application is required to be referred to the Heritage Council for approval.

Elizabeth Evans
B.Arch
carste STUDIO pty ltd
Appendix A

Plan showing heritage layering and significant doors and windows